



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: May 22, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: David Morton, Acting-Chair Mark Armstrong, Member
Rodney Barker, Member Bill Roesner, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate Katy Hax Holmes, Staff
See Attendance List

ABSENT: Ellen Klapper, Alternate
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting-Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Armstrong, Barker, Roesner, Grissom and Fulkerson. Alternate member Sherman voted. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device. The first two items were taken out of order due to the late arrival of the presenter for 286 Waverly Road. The application for 90 Waverly Road was also heard later than what the agenda showed due to absence of the owners. They did not appear at the hearing.

182 Beethoven Avenue – Demolition Review

The current owner of this property, who presented a signed purchase and sale at the meeting, presented his plans to demolish only a portion of the building, and not the entire structure as was originally presented by the owners when the agenda was prepared. The owner told the Commission his plans to retain the main house block and take off the 1982 north side addition. The owner also presented proposed plans for new side and rear additions to the house.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1880, and that it did not appear on atlases until 1917 and was one of the first ten or so houses on the street. The property was owned in 1907 by Daniel Morgan, but when a house was built on the lot it was owned by John Martin, gardener, and his family until at least 1948. The house reportedly sustained damage to its piazza and north ell during the Hurricane of 1938. A large ell was added to the house in 1982. In 1960 the house was owned by the last name Meinhart; in 1975, the Voros family owned the house and continued their ownership to this day. Most of the houses

located in the immediate vicinity of this house had been either torn down and replaced, or altered. This neighborhood no longer retained its early 20th century historic architectural context, yet this house appeared to be one of the last Colonial Revival homes in the neighborhood. Staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Grissom made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Sherman seconded the motion and it passed unanimously 7-0.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 182 Beethoven Avenue **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: _____ Voting in the Negative _____ Abstained _____

Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Bill Roesner, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

The owner explained to the Commission that the house was a grandfathered two-family. Commission members reviewed the plans and told the owner that he was on the right track but did not present enough information for the Commission to make a decision. The owner was told he needed to provide the following information: all elevations, a plot plan, and proposed materials for the structure and the addition. The owner said he was proposing to sheathe the entire structure in cedar siding.

286 Waverly Road – Preservation Restriction

Cindy Stone, Director of Historic Newton, Inc, presented amended landscaping plans for the Durant Kenrick site, which included new fencing along the rear of the lot, and fewer garden plots than were previously proposed for the site. Ms. Stone told the Commission that the Durant Kenrick grounds were under the protection of a preservation restriction and that all changes must be reviewed by the Newton Historical Commission.

Ms. Stone explained that the updated plans included the installation of a 6' cedar fence along the rear of the lot behind the parking area to match existing fencing along the south side of the lot. Ms. Stone also proposed a change from six previously approved garden beds to three, which would allow more open space for outdoor activities.

Grissom made a motion to approve the fencing and garden bed changes proposed by Ms. Stone for the landscape at the Durant Kenrick property. Fulkerson seconded the motion and it passed unanimously 7-0.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to approve the fencing and garden bed changes proposed by Ms. Stone for the landscape at the Durant Kenrick property.

Voting in the Affirmative: _____ Voting in the Negative _____ Abstained _____

Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Bill Roesner, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

6 Beecher Terrace – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner, Julia Beecher, was represented by Peter LaBraum who stated it was the owners’ belief that the Cape Style house she was proposing to demolish was not historically significant. He told the Commission that there had been considerable construction on the street, and that this house was the only cape left, but that was a style that was very well represented in other Newton neighborhoods. He also told the Commission that the house needed to be sold in order to pay for the owners’ medical expenses.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1954 as a single family home, whose first owner was Charles Beecher , salesman(formerly of Newton Corner). In 1980, Charles added a concrete chimney block, and in 1994 ownership of the house transferred to his wife Julie. The Beechers were the only owners of this home. Tucked into a trapezoidal lot between much older houses, this Cape Style house underwent no substantive changes since its construction and was built to suit a lot that is defined by ledge. The immediate neighborhood was a mix of late 19th/early 20th century architecture with alterations, as well as some new housing. Though this house is the only Cape on the street, it was in intact condition and was built to suit the surrounding neighborhood. For this reason staff recommended finding the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

A Commission member stated that she did not believe this house was a gem of a cape. Other members concurred.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-3:

RESOLVED to find the building at 6 Beecher Terrace **not preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Mark Armstrong, Member	Rodney Barker, Member	
Nancy Grissom, Member	Dave Morton, Acting Chair	
Jean Fulkerson, Member	Bill Roesner, Member	
Len Sherman, Alternate		

102 Windsor Road, NR – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The current owner of the house, Karen Jonash, told the Commission that she did not want to demolish her house of 25 years, but that the property had been on the market for at least four months and she wanted the demolition option to be available for possible developers.

Staff reported that the property was located in the Windsor Road Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990. The house at 102 Windsor Road was recognized to be of “greater architectural distinction” in a district made notable by its collection of intact Queen Anne, Shingle, Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor Revival Style houses built from the 1880s to the 1940s. Designed by H. Langford Warren in the Queen Anne Style with Shingle Style elements, Alexander Davidson is listed as the first owner of the 2 ½ story house, which features overhanging façade gables, oriels, segmental arched windows, and an oversized turret porch roof. The house definitively appears on insurance maps by 1907, with Joseph A. Bryant the owner at that time. By 1917, the owner was Gertrude M. Stevens; by 1929, it was Louella B. Gates. In 1925, Gates enclosed an open porch into a sun room. Interior renovations were conducted by various owners until 1989, when the current owners expanded the kitchen; added an addition inside the front porch; added a deck and greenhouse to the rear of the detached garage; and in 2007 enclosed portions of the rear deck. Due to its listing on the National Register of Historic Places, staff recommended the house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

There was no comment from the audience. Len Sherman recused himself as a neighbor to the house.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed. Grissom seconded the motion and it passed 6-0-1 with Sherman recused.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to find the National Register-listed house at 102 Windsor Road preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Mark Armstrong, Member		Len Sherman, Alternate
Rodney Barker, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		

184 Windsor Road, NR – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The current owner of the house, Richard Cohen, told the Commission that he too wanted the option for possible buyers to demolish the house.

Staff reported that the property was located in the Windsor Road Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990. The house at 184 Windsor Road was recognized as contributing to the historic district made notable by its collection of intact Queen Anne, Shingle, Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor Revival Style houses built from the 1880s to the 1940s. Built in 1898 in the Queen Anne Style, this house was built in a style consistent with others on the street and in the district, though no architect for the house is apparent. The land for this and other homes along Windsor Road was owned by William Strong. The first owner of the house was M. Grace Jones as of 1907. By 1929, the house was owned by Abbie R. Brown, who with her family owned the house until at least 1964. F.F. O'Halloran owned the house in 1967 when the first and second floors were enlarged by enclosing the porch. In 1983 the home was owned by Noreen and Richard Doyle who obtained a variance for a deck. In

1997 the deck was extended and a rear bedroom was added by owners Richard and Wendy Cohen. Due to the fact that this house is listed on the National Register of Historic Places, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

There was no comment from the audience. Len Sherman recused himself as a neighbor to the house.

Grissom made a motion to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed. Roesner seconded the motion and it passed 6-0-1 with Sherman recused.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to find the National Register-listed house at 184 Windsor Road preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Mark Armstrong, Member		Len Sherman, Alternate
Rodney Barker, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		

189 Windsor Road, NR – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The current owner of the house, Rob Freidman, told the Commission that he too wanted the option for possible buyers to demolish the house.

Staff reported that the property was located in the Windsor Road Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990. The house at 189 Windsor Road was recognized as contributing to the historic district made notable by its collection of intact Queen Anne, Shingle, Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor Revival Style houses built from the 1880s to the 1940s. Designed by Edward B. Stratton between 1917 and 1921 in the Colonial Revival Style, this house was part of a body of Stratton’s work that included hotels, Swampscott Country Club, the Police Annex in West Newton, the house at 25 Kenmore Street in Newton (NR listed), the apartment building at 90 Commonwealth Avenue and the Gurley Building in Stamford, CT, also listed on the National Register. In 1921 a building permit for this house was issued to the owner F.W. Webster, who at that time lived at 181 Windsor Road. As part of that permit, the garage was designed to be at basement level. In 1925 the owner was Orville Forte, who added a screened piazza. In 1936, the owner was Gilbert Talman, Jr. who continued to own the house until 1957. In 1971, a first floor addition was added to the rear of the house and the detached garage was moved. A new bay window was added in 1986. Vinyl siding was also apparently added. Due to the fact that this house is listed on the National Register of Historic Places, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

There was no comment from the audience. Len Sherman recused himself as a neighbor to the house.

Grissom made a motion to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed. Roesner seconded the motion and it passed 6-0-1 with Sherman recused.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to find the National Register-listed house at 189 Windsor Road preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Mark Armstrong, Member		Len Sherman, Alternate
Rodney Barker, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		

A Commission member asked about the local landmark process and how the Commission might pursue landmarking these National Register-listed homes. Staff promised to send info to the Commission on how nominations might be made.

81 Wayne Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner of Pinecone Construction, Frank Utano, presented his plan to demolish this house. He also reported that the original houses along Wayne Road had high groundwater and that their basements had water issues.

Staff reported that this split-level Ranch house was built in 1960 as part of a larger development of split-level homes overlooking conservation land. Robert Devlin was listed on the building permit as the architect, but he was actually a builder from Framingham with Wayne Construction Company and he obtained the building permit for this house in 1957. Samuel Mednick owned the house in 1961. In 1970, the house was owned by Elliot Fries, a sales rep. Sumner and Muriel Hoberman were the owners in 1985, and in August of that year filed an insurance claim on the house. Intact houses of similar style are located to the west of this house. Most of the split-level ranches to the east of this house have been demolished and replaced with larger homes. Due to the fact that this neighborhood is in transition, staff recommended that the house be found not preferably preserved.

Commission members debated the contextual merits of the house and its neighborhood and whether or not historical context could be supported in this case.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved due to the transitional changes in neighborhood context. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 81 Wayne Road **not preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Mark Armstrong, Member	Rodney Barker, Member	
Len Sherman, Alternate	Bill Roesner, Member	
Nancy Grissom, Member		

Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Jean Fulkerson, Member

59 Kilburn Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Greg Shay of Kane Built Homes presented evidence to suggest that the house at this location was not historically significant. He told the Commission that the house was a very small Cape, sheathed in aluminum siding with no real architectural details of note. Mr. Shay used a GIS map to research dates of the houses in the neighborhood, and contended that the oldest and most significant portion of the neighborhood was located to the north of this house. The house also had deferred maintenance and mold issues.

Staff reported that the original building permit on file for this Cape Style house showed that it was first issued in 1947 to Francis J. Gormley of Quincy. The architect was listed as Firesafe Builders Production Corp. and the builder listed as A.L. Girard. By 1950, a new building permit was issued to Lawrence M. Whitmer of Wellesley who was listed on the permit as owner and builder. The proposed house on both permits is of the same dimensions. In 1959 a building permit was issued for a garage to the rear of the house. From at least 1968 to today, the family of Dominic Pecorari (clerk) family has owned the house. A.L. Girard also built the house next door at 51-53 Kilburn. The land for this house was subdivided from a larger parcel located at the northwest corner of Henshaw and Kilburn. Map evidence from the 1929 insurance map showed the lot for 59 Kilburn, but with no house on it. The northern half of Kilburn Road was developed by 1929. The eastern portion of Kilburn, as well as this lot, was developed in the 1930s and 40s. This Cape Style house was therefore evidence of an architecturally evolving neighborhood from the 1920s through post-war. As such, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the property preferably preserved. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-4:

RESOLVED to find the house at 59 Kilburn Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member	Mark Armstrong, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member	Len Sherman, Alternate	
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Nancy Grissom, Member	
	Jean Fulkerson, Member	

The motion did not pass.

90 Washburn Avenue – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owners of this property were not present.

Staff reported that the house was built c.1900, and that this Colonial Revival Style house had undergone some external changes over time, including the replacement of all of its windows and the addition of aluminum siding. The massing, location and general architectural details of the house remained intact, as

was true of the surrounding neighborhood. In 1929, the house was owned by Milton and Myrtle Allen (salesman), who received a permit that year to enclose a rear porch. Another salesman, Joseph A. Manning, owned the house in 1948. In 1966, the house was owned by George Kiley, a custodian at the Hyde School. In 1971, Russell Milligan, a driver with the City street department, owned the house. Washburn Avenue was platted in 1895 and owned by the heirs of David O. Clark. Though the street was subdivided, there were as yet no houses built in 1895. The house first appeared on the 1907 insurance map. Though the house had undergone changes, it was located in a neighborhood of buildings of the same age, massing, and style. As such, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Commission members who had visited the neighborhood said they could vouch for the fact that the neighborhood remained largely intact.

Sherman made a motion to find the property preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Roesner seconded the motion and it passed unanimously 7-0.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 90 Washburn Avenue **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		

92 Beethoven Street– Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Ralph Vacca, owner of this property, told the Commission he had plans to demolish the house and garage at this address. He said he had no information on the architect or builder of the original house, and that it was all Home Depot to him.

Staff reported that the brick Ranch style house was built in 1938, and located at the corner of Beethoven Ave. and Puritan Road. Frank Saddler was listed as the owner when it was built in 1938. The architect was W.J. Freethy, likely to be William J. Freethy of Martin & Freethy Architects in Boston; and the builder was D. Soncini. Frank Saddler, art supervisor for the Christian Science Monitor Publishing Company, continued to own the house in 1946, and in that year obtained a permit to add a door to the rear of his garage. In 1974 the owner was still Saddler. In 1987 the owner was Anthony Tommasini, who in that year built a rear deck. In 1990 the house was owned by Ina Brother, and in 1993 a permit was issued to house a day care center in the basement. A special permit was later issued which allowed off-site parking for the day care center. The house had a rear addition added in 1999. The neighborhood context for this house is largely found behind it on Puritan Road, which saw development of housing from the 1930s and 40s and which is largely intact. Houses located across the street on Beethoven Avenue are for the most part replacement houses constructed since 2000. Due to the intact historical context of houses on Puritan Road, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

The abutter living behind this house on Puritan Road spoke in support of saving the house, and that to allow new development on this lot would encroach on the architectural integrity of Puritan Road.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historical context. Barker seconded the motion and it passed 6-1.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 22, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 92 Beethoven Avenue **preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member	Mark Armstrong, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		

125 Webster Street, NR – Demolition Review

Request for partial demo of rear façade and garage

At the April meeting of this Commission, this property was found preferably preserved. This house is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and as such an 18-month delay was imposed on the house. The owner returned to the May hearing with plans for a partial demolition (e.g. a rear addition).

At the April meeting, Staff reported that this house was located in a National Register Historic District and was built c.1860 in the Italianate Style. The end-gable structure with returns faces Webster Street, with an arched window in the gable that is emblematic of the Italianate Style. The front veranda on the house is a later addition and was built in the Queen Anne style, likely from the 1880s. Mrs. Charles May a widow and Lydia Dodge, a local grammar school teacher owned the house in 1874. Due to the house's location in a National Register district and the fact that it retains its historical context, massing and detail, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

John DePaulus and Michael McKay, architect for the owner, presented plans for side-by-side rectangular units that had architectural details which sought to emulate the existing Italianate structure. After some discussion, the neighbors of this property, both of whom were architects, presented a proposed alternative that was universally accepted, including by Mr. McKay, as an improved site plan over what was being proposed. No waiver to the delay was issued at this meeting.

Administrative Items:

Minutes from the April meeting were unanimously approved by a 5-0 vote. The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:10 pm.

Katy Hax Holmes
Commission Staff

Approved